

Official Bi-Monthly Journal of the International Society for Knowledge Organization

ISSN 0943 – 7444

International Journal devoted to Concept Theory, Classification, Indexing and Knowledge Representation

Contents

Articles

Martin Thellefsen, Torkild Thellefsen and Brent Sørenson.	
A Pragmatic Semiotic Perspective on the Concept of Information Need and Its Relevance for Knowledge Organization.....	213
Carlos Cândido de Almeida, Mariângela Spotti Lopes Fujita and Daniela Marjorie dos Reis.	
Peircean Semiotics and Subject Indexing: Contributions of Speculative Grammar and Pure Logic	225
Jens-Erik Mai.	
Ethics, Values and Morality in Contemporary Library Classifications	242

Papers from the Fourth North American Symposium on Knowledge Organization, sponsored by ISKO-Canada, United States, 13-14 June, 2013, Milwaukee, Wisconsin

Christine Marchese and Richard P. Smiraglia.	
Boundary Objects: CWA, an HR Firm, and Emergent Vocabulary	254
Melodie J. Fox and Austin Reece.	
The Impossible Decision: Social Tagging and Derrida's Deconstructed Hospitality	260
Melissa Adler and Joseph T. Tennis.	
Toward a Taxonomy of Harm in Knowledge Organization Systems	266
Richard P. Smiraglia.	
Is FRBR A Domain? Domain Analysis Applied to the Literature of <i>The FRBR Family of Conceptual Models</i>	273

KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION

KO

Official Bi-Monthly Journal of the International Society for Knowledge Organization

ISSN 0943 – 7444

International Journal devoted to Concept Theory, Classification, Indexing and Knowledge Representation

Contents pages

Thellefsen, Martin, Thellefsen, Torkild, and Sørensen, Bent. **A Pragmatic Semeiotic Perspective on the Concept of Information Need and Its Relevance for Knowledge Organization.** *Knowledge Organization*. 40(3), 213-224. 53 references.

ABSTRACT: The organization of information and the process of seeking information are fundamental activities, and thus fields of study, related to library and information science (LIS). Both endeavors are pragmatic in the sense that the ideas of information seeking behavior and the process of organizing information relates to some ideas of how users tend to behave when information is needed in order to fulfill a task of some kind. An important difference is, however, that information systems are primarily driven by principles of semantic structure, whereas users are driven by genuine information needs. Knowledge organization (KO), which is considered a subfield within LIS, has a particular focus on the organization of semantic units, and their relations (Hjørland 2008; Hodge 2000; Thellefsen 2010), however, it is our impression that the users information need, even though acknowledged, often is neglected or only mentioned en passant. The concept of information need is a core concept in LIS, and is, in particular, a core concept within the subfield of information retrieval (IR) that describes the state of uncertainty or anomalous knowledge state that precedes a user's information seeking behavior. Information need is, however, an intricate concept, and is only addressed in the LIS literature as some kind of elusive cognitive state. One may ask 'is an information need always individual or personal, and under what circumstances?' The present paper argues that the concept of information need may profit from a pragmatic and semeiotic perspective, which also may prove fruitful for KO. The paper thus discusses the concept of information need through three premises that is formulated based in Peirce's pragmatic semeiotic: 1) as the intricate relation between belief and doubt, 2) as a pragmatic process of clarification, and 3) as an activity of cognition taking place within a universe of discourse. The paper is rounded by a discussion of how this semeiotic analysis can be useful for KO.

de Almeida, Carlos Cândido, Spotti Lopes Fujita, Mariângela, and dos Reis, Daniela Marjorie. **Peircean Semiotics and Subject Indexing: Contributions of Speculative Grammar and Pure Logic.** *Knowledge Organization*. 40(3), 225-241. 46 references.

ABSTRACT: The semiotics of C. S. Peirce presents fundamental concepts to discover aspects of the indexing process, including representation and classes of signs. However, we still know little of its theoretical potential for subject indexing. We believe that the main difficulty in the proposals to understand the proc-

ess of subject indexing based on Peircean semiotics stems from an incomplete interpretation of his semiotic system. This paper attempts to describe the contributions of Peircean semiotics to subject indexing. First, we analyze some of the concepts of the branches of semiotics, after which, we discuss strategies for conceptual approximation. Secondly, and aiming to raise the level of interlocution between the areas, we intend to argue that subject indexing is an inferential process, as explained by the second branch of semiotics. Thus, we seek to go beyond the level of speculative grammar, the first branch of semiotics, to forge a closer link with pure or critical logic, the second branch. We conclude that the indexer's work does not produce a mere reflection of what already exists in documents, but involves an instigating action to discover, through the inferential matrix, the meaning of a text in order to find the subject and the most appropriate subject added entry to the information system.

Mai, Jens-Erik. **Ethics, Values and Morality in Contemporary Library Classifications.** *Knowledge Organization*. 40(3), 242-253. 43 references.

ABSTRACT: This paper explores the ethics of classification. The paper outlines recent conceptual moves in knowledge organization research and shows that contemporary classification theory is based on a pragmatic understanding of the world. It suggests that unjust statements and assumptions about the world challenge contemporary library classifications and that a proper response is needed. It outlines a framework for the development of ethical classifications based on MacIntyre's practice-based ethical theory. It provides a framework within which editors and managers of library classifications can make ethically sound decisions.

Marchese, Christine and Smiraglia, Richard P. **Boundary Objects: CWA, an HR Firm, and Emergent Vocabulary.** *Knowledge Organization*. 40(3), 254-259. 5 references.

ABSTRACT: Knowledge organization structures are dependent upon domain-analytical processes for determining ontological imperatives. Boundary objects—terms used in multiple domains but understood differently in each—are ontological clash points. Cognitive Work Analysis is an effective qualitative methodology for domain analysis of a group of people who work together. CWA was used recently to understand the ontology of a human resources firm. Boundary objects from the taxonomy that emerged from narrative analysis are presented here for individual analysis.

Official Bi-Monthly Journal of the International Society for Knowledge Organization

ISSN 0943 – 7444

International Journal devoted to Concept Theory, Classification, Indexing and Knowledge Representation

Fox, Melodie J. and Reece, Austin. **The Impossible Decision: Social Tagging and Derrida's Deconstructed Hospitality.** *Knowledge Organization*. 40(3), 260-265. 14 references.

ABSTRACT: Social tagging has been lauded for providing a voice of the user community, free of restrictions dictated by knowledge organization standards for subject access. Tagging allows many perspectives to be represented, but at what cost? Using deconstruction, Derrida argues that absolute hospitality is required to ensure justice for access and inclusiveness; however, the consequence becomes that the host becomes hostage to the *other*. In this ongoing research, we explore the Derridean concept of hospitality as it relates to social tagging, examining the consequences of unconditional inclusiveness, the process of discerning constraints to hospitality in order to interpret different kinds of "otherness"—or what Derrida calls the "impossible" decision—and what mitigation means, using the social tagging environment to illustrate.

Adler, Melissa and Tannis, Joseph T. **Toward a Taxonomy of Harm in Knowledge Organization Systems.** *Knowledge Organization*. 40(3), 266-272. 13 references.

ABSTRACT: A starting point for contributing to the greater good is to examine and interrogate existing knowledge organization practices that do harm, whether that harm is intentional or accidental, or an inherent and unavoidable evil. As part of the transition movement, the authors propose to inventory the manifestations and implications of the production of suffering by knowledge organization systems through constructing a tax-

onomy of harm. Theoretical underpinnings guide ontological commitment, as well as the recognition of the problem of harm in knowledge organization systems. The taxonomy of harm will be organized around three main questions: what happens?, who participates?, and who is affected and how? The aim is to heighten awareness of the violence that classifications and naming practices carry, to unearth some of the social conditions and motivations that contribute to and are reinforced by knowledge organization systems, and to advocate for intentional and ethical knowledge organization practices to achieve a minimal level of harm.

Smiraglia, Richard P. **Is FRBR A Domain? Domain Analysis Applied to the Literature of The FRBR Family of Conceptual Models.** *Knowledge Organization*. 40(3), 273-282. 7 references.

ABSTRACT: Domain analysis helps visualize the semantic intellectual content of a coherent group, or domain. A domain is a group with an ontological base, an underlying teleology, common hypotheses and epistemology, and social semantics. FRBR has spawned a family of conceptual models and much writing. A recent second anthology about the FRBR models raises the question of whether a coherent domain has formed around the FRBR family. Domain analysis is used here to visualize the semantic content of the FRBR family domain and to compare its two main component groups, scholar authors and practitioner authors. Results show a common teleology with some subtle differences surrounding implementation of the FRBR family of models.